



Resource Management - Purchasing & Contracts

Stephen Koontz, Purchasing and Contracts Manager

1301 East Second St., Sanford, FL 32771

(407) 665-7116

TABULATION SHEET OF PROPOSALS RECEIVED

RFP-604985-25/LTT - Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

Response Deadline: April 16, 2025 at 2:00 pm

Report Generated: Wednesday, April 16, 2025

SUBMITTED PROPOSALS	
Vendor	Location
Broussard Cullen & Eldridge, P.A.	Orlando, FL
Dean, Ringers, Morgan & Lawton, P.A.	Orlando, FL
HR Law, P.A.	Orlando, FL

Posted By: Liduvina Torres, Sr. Procurement Analyst

Evaluation Meeting: May 5, 2025 at 9:00 AM at 1101 E. 1st St., Sanford, FL 32771 - 3rd Fl., Conf. Rm. 3026.

Presentations/Interviews Meeting: N/A

Recommendation and Notice of Intent to Award to: Broussard Cullen & Eldridge, P.A.

BOCC Meeting Date: June 10, 2025 - Request to approve ranking and award a Term Contract with the top-ranked firm.

(Updated and Posted by Liduvina Torres, Sr. Procurement Analyst, May 5, 2025)



Seminole County
Resource Management - Purchasing & Contracts

Diane Reed, Purchasing and Contracts Manager

1301 East Second St., Sanford, FL 32771

EVALUATION FINAL RANKING

RFP-604985-25/LTT - Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

Response Deadline: April 16, 2025 at 2:00 pm

Location: 1101 E 1st St., Sanford, FL 32771, Conf. Room 3024

AGGREGATE SCORES SUMMARY

Vendor	Ralph Caravello	Alicia Castillo	Cassidy Perdue	Total Score (Max Score 100)	Total Average Rank
Broussard, Cullen, & Eldridge, P.A.	99	99	93	97	1.33
Dean, Ringers, Morgan & Lawton, P.A.	89	92	90	90.33	2.33
HR Law, P.A.	85	85	94	88	2.33

We approve the above-stated ranking and recommend award to Broussard, Cullen, & Eldridge, P.A..

Ralph Caravello Digitally signed by Ralph Caravello
Date: 2025.05.05 12:23:43 -04'00'
Ralph Caravello

Alicia Castillo Digitally signed by Alicia Castillo
Date: 2025.05.05 13:58:48 -04'00'
Alicia Castillo

Cassidy Perdue Digitally signed by Cassidy Perdue
Date: 2025.05.05 14:06:05 -04'00'
Cassidy Perdue



Seminole County
Resource Management - Purchasing & Contracts
Robert T. Bradley, Purchasing and Contracts Manager
1301 East Second St., Sanford, FL 32771

EVALUATION TABULATION
RFP No. RFP-604985-25/LTT
Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation
RESPONSE DEADLINE: April 16, 2025 at 2:00 pm

EVALUATORS

Name	Title	Agreement Accepted On
Ralph Caravello	Risk Manager	Apr 29, 2025 11:14 AM
Alicia Castillo	Claims Manager	Apr 29, 2025 4:11 PM
Cassidy Perdue	Assistant County Attorney	Apr 29, 2025 12:48 PM

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Staff Experience	Points Based	30 (30% of Total)

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
General Experience of the Firm and References	Points Based	25 (25% of Total)

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Government and Presumptive Heart Claim Experience	Points Based	25 (25% of Total)

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Price Proposal	Points Based	20 (20% of Total)

AGGREGATE SCORES SUMMARY

Vendor	Ralph Caravello	Alicia Castillo	Cassidy Perdue	Total Score (Max Score 100)	Total Average Rank
Broussard Cullen & Eldridge, P.A.	99 (1)	99 (1)	93 (2)	97	1.33
Dean, Ringers, Morgan & Lawton, PA	89 (2)	92 (2)	90 (3)	90.33	2.33
HR Law, P.A.	85 (3)	85 (3)	94 (1)	88	2.33

VENDOR SCORES BY EVALUATION CRITERIA

Vendor	Staff Experience Points Based 30 Points (30%)	General Experience of the Firm and References Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Government and Presumptive Heart Claim Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Price Proposal Points Based 20 Points (20%)	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Broussard Cullen & Eldridge, P.A.	29.3	24.3	24.3	19	97
Dean, Ringers, Morgan & Lawton, PA	27.7	21.7	23	18	90.33
HR Law, P.A.	26	21	21	20	88

INDIVIDUAL PROPOSAL SCORES

Broussard Cullen & Eldridge, P.A.
Staff Experience Points Based 30 Points (30%)
Ralph Caravello: 30

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. RFP-604985-25/LTT

Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

Broussard & Cullen have vast experience handling worker's compensation claims, including government with an emphasis in central Florida. Ms. Cullen is currently the Chair of the Workers' Compensation Section of the Florida Bar, which is very impressive.

Alicia Castillo: 30

Both attorney Cullen and Broussard have extensive legal experience; 20+ years each in practice specializing in workers' compensation defense for government entities.

Cassidy Perdue: 28

Karen Cullen has done WC defense for 27 years and is board certified in WC. Michael Broussard has done WC defense since 1984. Both have significant trial and appellate experience and have argued before the 1st DCA and Florida Supreme Court.

General Experience of the Firm and References | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Ralph Caravello: 25

Firm has been practicing in Florida for 33 years. Mr. Broussard began practicing law in 1980, 45 years ago. Ms. Cullen has been practicing law for over 25 years. Firm has represented Seminole County BoCC for the past 20+ years. Broussard & Cullen represent over 40 government entities in Florida.

Alicia Castillo: 25

Extensive experience with government entities providing defense work. The attorneys and legal team are responsive and professional.

Cassidy Perdue: 23

The firm was founded in 1992 and is well established. Orange County has been a client since 1992. Seminole County has been a client since 1996. Indian River County since 2021. Public Risk Management Florida since 2020. Davies and Ambridge are references as well.

Government and Presumptive Heart Claim Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Ralph Caravello: 25

Broussard & Cullen represent over 40 government entities in Florida. The firm has over 140 open presumptive claims and includes extremely complex heart disease claims. Their vast experience in this area is impressive.

Alicia Castillo: 25

Strengths: represents 40 government entities; extensive and unique experience involving presumptive claims with first responders; the firm is well-known in the legal community.

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Proposal - Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. RFP-604985-25/LTT

Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

Cassidy Perdue: 23

The three partners have nearly one hundred (100) years of combined legal experience and the firm represents more than 40 governmental entities. Presumption claims represent a significant part of Broussard's practice. Heart/Lung writing sample by Broussard was concise and persuasive.

Price Proposal | Points Based | 20 Points (20%)

Ralph Caravello: 19

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Alicia Castillo: 19

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Cassidy Perdue: 19

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Dean, Ringers, Morgan & Lawton, PA

Staff Experience | Points Based | 30 Points (30%)

Ralph Caravello: 27

Vast experience provided by worker's compensation attorneys. References not provided as per the RFP.

Alicia Castillo: 28

Full range of staff experienced lawyers from entry to seasoned.

Cassidy Perdue: 28

Frank C. Wesighan (40 years WC experience and BC since 1991) and Jeffry Branham (WC defense since 1986 and BC), both Senior Shareholders, would be designated as the primary attorneys. Jessica Conner is a shareholder and board-certified appellate attorney who has argued before US Supreme Court. the Firm employs 19 Florida Registered Paralegals, one Registered Nurse Paralegal (on staff for 30 years), 16 Legal Assistants.

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. RFP-604985-25/LTT

Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

General Experience of the Firm and References | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Ralph Caravello: 22

Firm represents a wide range of specialties. Would like to have seen a more detailed summary of worker's compensation specific details. Quantification of the number of entities that the firm represents under worker's comp would have been helpful.

Alicia Castillo: 23

Strength: large firm offering expertise with government entities and resources. Weaknesses: Large firm/high case volume, it can lead to less personalized attention, resulting in slower or lack communication with client.

Cassidy Perdue: 20

Firm was founded in 1976 and has specialized in the defense of governmental Workers' Compensation cases for almost 50 years. Doesn't appear that they included references.

Government and Presumptive Heart Claim Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Ralph Caravello: 22

Impressive experience but would have liked to seen more information on current open presumptive claims that the attorneys are handling. More case information on successfully litigated presumptive claims would also have been helpful.

Alicia Castillo: 23

Strength: large firm offering expertise with government entities and resources. Weaknesses: Large firm/high case volume, it can lead to less personalized attention, resulting in slower or lack communication with client.

Cassidy Perdue: 24

Firm was founded in 1976 and has specialized in the defense of governmental Workers' Compensation cases for almost 50 years. Doesn't appear that they included references.

Price Proposal | Points Based | 20 Points (20%)

Ralph Caravello: 18

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Alicia Castillo: 18

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Proposal - Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

Page 5

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Cassidy Perdue: 18

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

HR Law, P.A.

Staff Experience | Points Based | 30 Points (30%)

Ralph Caravello: 25

Quite a bit of experience in the private sector. Not nearly as much public sector experience as other submissions. Tim Stanton- only one reference provided. Brian Ricotta's references- hard to tell what sort of government connection since those listed all are WC adjusters.

Alicia Castillo: 25

Limited experience with government entities

Cassidy Perdue: 28

Rex Hurley (BC since 1990) is principal attorney and focuses his practice on presumption cases. He is counsel to Florida Sheriff's Risk Management Fund since 2003. Greg White (WC defense since 1996 and BC since 2002) he represents Seminole County School Board. Tim Stanton (WC defense since 1989 and BC since 1996) works with numerous municipalities and handled many presumption cases for Florida Sheriff's Risk Management Fund.

General Experience of the Firm and References | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Ralph Caravello: 20

Under 'summaries of cases litigated by', there is a "click here to view order" (apparently the JCC order). However, the order is not found when attempting to 'click here'. Would have been helpful to know the agencies involved under the summary of litigated cases. No idea how many of those are government entities.

Alicia Castillo: 20

Limited experience with government entities. References were mainly sheriff's office.

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. RFP-604985-25/LTT

Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation

Cassidy Perdue: 23

Firm was founded 33 years ago and is a statewide practice with primary office in Orlando. Firm has largest number of BC lawyers of any firm in Florida. References include Florida Sheriff's Risk Management Fund, Seminole County Sheriff's Office, adjusters and in house counsel for an Excess Carrier.

Government and Presumptive Heart Claim Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Ralph Caravello: 20

Response states that Mr. Hurley "has handled hundreds and hundreds of presumption claims". I do not know what number that is- would have helped to have an actual number. Experience seems to be focused towards law enforcement, would have liked to see more on firefighters as that is what job field Seminole County's presumption claims are in. On page 210 of the response, there is a statement that HR law handles presumption claims for Seminole County School Board. That is factually not correct as Seminole schools does not have presumption claims.

Alicia Castillo: 20

Limited experience with government entities. References were mainly sheriff's office.

Cassidy Perdue: 23

Rex Hurley has extensive presumptive heart experience. Tim Stanton also appears to be heavily involved in presumptive cases. Writing samples were well written and persuasive.

Price Proposal | Points Based | 20 Points (20%)

Ralph Caravello: 20

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Alicia Castillo: 20

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

Cassidy Perdue: 20

Based on the calculated rates submitted.

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Proposal - Legal Services for Workers' Compensation Claims and Litigation